

MANUSCRIPTS IN THE SCHØYEN COLLECTION · III



# BUDDHIST MANUSCRIPTS

Volume II

**General Editor:**  
Jens Braarvig

**Editorial Committee:**  
Jens Braarvig, Paul Harrison, Jens-Uwe Hartmann, Kazunobu Matsuda, Lore Sander

HERMES PUBLISHING · OSLO

2002

## Two More Folios of the Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins\*

Seishi Karashima

### Introduction

The two folios dealt with in this article are probably parts of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the *Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins*, like MS 2382/269, which I examined in the first volume of the present series.<sup>1</sup>

The first one, namely MS 2382/270, deals with the *pācattika* offence of a monk who allows one (probably a novice) to start and stop reciting dharmas (e.g., “contact by the eye is impermanent,” “contact by the ear is impermanent,” and so on) simultaneously with him. This *pācattika* offence is fully explained in the commentary part of the sixth *pācattika* found in the Chinese translation of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas (an English translation of which is included in this article).<sup>2</sup> Commentaries on the same offence are also found in other Vinaya texts belonging to various other traditions.<sup>3</sup> When we compare our folio with these commentaries, we find right away that it agrees most closely with the commentary found in the *Mahāsāṃghika-Vinaya*. Therefore, we may assume that this is a folio of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas, or that of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins, a branch of the former. This assumption is reinforced by the repeated occurrence in this folio of the word *pācattikaṃ*, which is a technical term characteristic of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravāda tradition.<sup>4</sup>

The second folio, of which about two thirds is preserved in five different fragments, namely MS 2381/7, 2382/uf6/4f, 2382/uf6/2c, 2381/67 and 2381/109, is also part of a commentary on a *pācattika* offence. The deed of a monk who boasts of having acquired superhuman dharmas is condemned as such.<sup>5</sup> Similar commentaries on the offence are found also in the Chinese translation

\* For this present work, I should like to extend my sincere thanks to Dr. Lore Sander, Prof. Jens Braarvig, Prof. Jens-Uwe Hartmann, Prof. Kazunobu Matsuda and Prof. Paul Harrison who kindly invited me to contribute this article to the present volume, provided me with colour photocopies of the fragments, and gave me much invaluable guidance and advice throughout. For the identification of the folios I am deeply indebted to Dr. Klaus Wille, who had previously transliterated them provisionally and recognised them as parts of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravāda Vinaya. Thanks are also due to my long-time friend, Peter Lait, who took the trouble to check my English for me, and to Shayne Clarke, who made a number of useful suggestions with regard to my translations.

<sup>1</sup> “A fragment of the Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins,” BMSC I: 233–241.

<sup>2</sup> MaVin. 336c25–337a12.

<sup>3</sup> Vin IV 15.1f. (Pācittiya 4); MśVin 40a3–6 (Pātayantikā 6); DhVin 639a7f. (Pātayantikā 6); SaVin 71a23f. (Pātayantikā 6; cf. VinVibh(R) 133); MūVinVibh(Ch.) 771c25f. (Pāyantikā 6) = MūVinVibh(Tib.), TibT, vol. 1, p. 510, 519.4f. This *pācattika* offence has been investigated in relation to the issue of sūtra-recitation in the ancient Buddhist Community by Lévi (1915: 422f.) and Nishimura (1990:184f.). I am grateful to Paul Harrison for directing my attention to Lévi’s article.

<sup>4</sup> Cf. Roth 1968: 345f.; v. Hinüber 1985: 63f. The Middle Indic forms *pāyattika*, *pācattika*, Pā. *pācittiya*, Pkt. *pacchittiya*, etc. are derived from Skt *prāyaścitta* (“atonement, expiation, amends, satisfaction” [MW.]), cf. v. Hinüber 1985: 63f.; 2001: §142.

<sup>5</sup> If what the monk says is not true, he commits a *pārājika*, the gravest type of offence, and is expelled from the Community.

of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas (the seventh *pācattika*: an English translation is included in this article)<sup>6</sup> and in Vinaya texts of other traditions.<sup>7</sup> When we compare our folio with these commentaries, we find the former agrees most closely with the commentary of the Mahāsāṃghikas. Moreover, technical terms which are characteristic of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravāda tradition, such as *pācattika*, *deśanā-gāmi-vinayātikkrāma* and *samvara-gāmi-vinayātikkrāma*,<sup>8</sup> are also found in this folio.

Therefore, in conclusion, we may say that these folios are parts of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādins.

As the script (Gilgit/Bamiyan Type I), the number of lines (5 lines) and the width of these two folios are identical, we may assume that they belong to the same manuscript. On the left margin of MS 2382/270 recto, the folio number "136" is written, while on the left margin of MS 2381/7 recto, we find "14(x)" (the last number is broken off). Therefore, it appears that these two folios were originally located quite close to each other in the manuscript. This assumption is supported by the fact that their Chinese parallels, namely the commentaries on the sixth and seventh *pācattikas* found in the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas, are also found close together in this sequence.

The linguistic features of our folios are basically similar to those of F. Edgerton's "Group I" of Buddhist Sanskrit texts (BHS p. xxv). Apart from the words *pācattika*, *deśanā-gāmi-vinayātikkrāma* and *samvara-g*<sup>9</sup>, which have been noted above, other noteworthy words and phrases are as follows: *anubhāṣati* ("recites after, repeats"),<sup>9</sup> *annāhanati* ("continues"?),<sup>10</sup> *ādiyati* ("starts"),<sup>11</sup> *osapeti* ("stops"),<sup>12</sup> *samakaṃ* ("simultaneously"),<sup>13</sup> *so eṣo bhikṣuḥ* ("if a certain monk").<sup>14</sup> These forms or meanings are not recorded in any of the dictionaries which I have checked so far.

### 1) MS 2382/270, folio 136

#### *Transliteration*

recto

1 pati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati evaṃ śrotravijñānaṃ ghrānavijñānaṃ jihvāvijñānaṃ kāyavijñānaṃ manovijñānaṃ anityaṃ manovijñānaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anu

2 bhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣu pācattikaṃ āsādayati cakṣuḥsaṃsparśaṃ anityaṃ cakṣuḥsaṃsparśaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣa

3 ti · na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pāca ○ ttikaṃ āsādayati evaṃ śrotrasaṃs[p]arśaṃ ghrāṇasaṃsparśaṃ jihvāsaṃsparśaṃ kāyasaṃsparśaṃ manosaṃsparśaṃ a ○ nityaṃ mano-

<sup>6</sup> MaVin. 337a20–b14.

<sup>7</sup> Vin IV 25.24f. (Pācittiya 8); MśVin. 40c8f. (Pātayantikā 8); DhVin. 639c23f. (Pātayantikā 8); SaVin. 72b7f. (Pātayantikā 7; cf. VinVibh(R). 133–134); MūVinVibh(Ch.). 774b6f. (Pāyantikā 8) = MūVinVibh(Tib.), TibT, vol. 1, p. 512, 539.6f.

<sup>8</sup> Cf. fn. 43.

<sup>9</sup> MS 2382/270 recto 2, 4 etc. Cf. fn. 23.

<sup>10</sup> MS 2382/270 recto 1, 2 etc. The derivation and the meaning of the word is unclear. Cf. fn. 18.

<sup>11</sup> MS 2382/270 recto 1, 2 etc. Cf. fn. 20.

<sup>12</sup> MS 2382/270 recto 1, 2 etc. Cf. fn. 22.

<sup>13</sup> MS 2382/270 recto 1, 2 etc. Cf. fn. 25.

<sup>14</sup> MS 2381/7 recto 1, 4, Verso 2. Cf. fn. 40.

saṃsparśaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ o<sup>15</sup>

4 sapeti uddiṣati na viramati<sup>16</sup> anubhaṇati a[nu]bhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ [p]ācattikaṃ āsādayati · cakṣuḥsaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā cakṣuḥsaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ oṣa

5 peti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati evaṃ śrotrasaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā ghrāṇasaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā jihvāsaṃsparśa

verso

1 jā vedanā anityā kāyasaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā manosamsparsājā vedanā anityā manosamsparsājā vedanā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati [na]

2 pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati · rūpā anityā rūpā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhi

3 kṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati · śabdā anityā ○ gandhā anityā rasā anityā spraṣṭavyā anityā dharmā anityā dharmā anityā ti · samakaṃ ādiyati sama ○ kaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati a[n]ubhaṇati anu

4 bhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣu pācattikaṃ āsādayati · rūpasamjñā anityā rūpasamjñā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti · uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na prati

5 <sup>17</sup>kṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati · śabdasaṃjñā gandhasamjñā rasasaṃjñā spraṣṭavyasaṃjñā dharmasaṃjñā anityā dharmasaṃjñā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati sama

### Reconstructed Text

(cakṣurvijñānaṃ anityaṃ cakṣurvijñānaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣi)ṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

evaṃ śrotravijñānaṃ ghrāṇavijñānaṃ jihvāvijñānaṃ kāyavijñānaṃ manovijñānaṃ anityaṃ manovijñānaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣu pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

cakṣuḥsaṃsparśaṃ anityaṃ cakṣuḥsaṃsparśaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

evaṃ śrotrasaṃsparśaṃ ghrāṇasaṃsparśaṃ jihvāsaṃsparśaṃ kāyasaṃsparśaṃ manosamsparsaṃ anityaṃ manosamsparsaṃ anityaṃ ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

cakṣuḥsaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā cakṣuḥsaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddiṣati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

evaṃ śrotrasaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā ghrāṇasaṃsparśajā vedanā anityā jihvāsaṃsparśavijā

<sup>15</sup> o is added on the right margin.

<sup>16</sup> The ms here has been corrected. Traces of the old version of the text are clearly visible beneath the words *sapeti ... anubhaṇati*. The corrected text must have been longer, because the akṣaras are written closer to each other.

<sup>17</sup> Because there is not enough height left in which to write full akṣaras, the last line begins only shortly before the first string-hole. The empty space is marked by short strokes of the pen.

vedanā anityā kāyasamsparsajā vedanā anityā manosamsparsajā vedanā anityā manosamsparsajā vedanā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddisati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati [na] 2 pratikṣipati annāhanati, bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

rūpā anityā rūpā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddisati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

śabdā anityā gandhā anityā rasā anityā spraṣṭavyā anityā dharmā anityā dharmā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddisati na viramati a[n]ubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣu pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

rūpasamjñā anityā rūpasamjñā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddisati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati |

śabdasaṃjñā gandhasaṃjñā rasasaṃjñā spraṣṭavyasaṃjñā dharmasaṃjñā anityā dharmasaṃjñā anityā ti samakaṃ ādiyati sama(kam) osapeti uddisati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati, bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati | )

### Translation

(If [a monk recites:] “Consciousness through the eye is impermanent,” [and one who is not ordained then] starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after [the monk], “Consciousness through the eye is impermanent,” and the monk) (r1) continues (?)<sup>18</sup> (without stopping [him]), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.<sup>19</sup>

Likewise, (if a monk recites) “Consciousness through the ear,” “Consciousness through the nose,” “Consciousness through the tongue,” “Consciousness through the body,” “Consciousness through the mind is impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts<sup>20</sup> simultaneously,<sup>21</sup> stops<sup>22</sup> simultaneously, recites without pausing, (r2) repeats, recites after<sup>23</sup> (the monk), “Consciousness through the mind is impermanent,” (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him),<sup>24</sup> the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.<sup>25</sup>

(If a monk recites) “Contact by the eye is impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then)

<sup>18</sup> *annāhanati*: The meaning of this word, which is not found elsewhere according to my knowledge, is unclear. From \**anv-āhanati* (“strikes after”)? The Chinese parallel found in the Vinaya of the Mahāsāṃghikas reads “enjoys,” which seems to indicate that its original text might have read *attamana* ṭi instead of *annāhanati* (the letters *tt* and *nn* look quite similar; and *ma* and *ha* were also occasionally confused in some scripts).

<sup>19</sup> *pācattikaṃ āsādayati*: Cf. PrMoSū(Mā-L), p. 16, l. 16. *yo puna bhikṣur anupasaṃpannaṃ pudgalaṃ padaṣo dharmam vāceya, pācattikaṃ* (Pācattika 6; “When one makes one who is not ordained speak Dharma line by line, that is a *pācattika*.”); cf. also Vin IV 14.30f. *yo pana bhikkhu anupasaṃpannaṃ padaṣo dhammaṃ vāceyya pācittiyam* (Pācittiya 4). For the expression *pācattikaṃ āsādayati*, cf. BhīVin(Mā-L) §192, 7A1.1. *pācattikaṃ āsādayati*.

<sup>20</sup> *ādiyati*: cf. CPD *ādiyati* “takes upon oneself, undertakes, performs.”

<sup>21</sup> *samakaṃ*: cf. Pkt. *samayaṃ* (< Skt. *samaka-*) “all at once, together with.” Skt. *samam* (“in like manner; together with, at the same time,” MW).

<sup>22</sup> *osapeti*: cf. CPD, *osāpeti* “finishes something, stops” (caus. of \**ava* + √*sā*).

<sup>23</sup> *anubhāṣati*: cf. CPD, *anubhāṣati* “speaks after, repeats.”

<sup>24</sup> *pratikṣipati*: lit. “rejects.”

<sup>25</sup> *samakaṃ ādiyati samakaṃ osapeti uddisati na viramati anubhaṇati anubhāṣati na pratikṣipati annāhanati bhikṣuḥ pācattikaṃ āsādayati*: Cf. Vin IV 15.1f. (“*padaso*” *nāma*:) *padam anupadam anavakkharam anubyañjanam. “padam” nāma: ekato paṭṭhapetvā ekato osāpentī. “anupadam” nāma: pātekkam paṭṭhapetvā ekato osāpentī. “anavakkharam” nāma: “rūpaṃ aniccaṃ” ti vuccamāno “run” ti opātetī. “anubyañjanam” nāma: “rūpaṃ aniccaṃ” ti vuccamāno “vedanā aniccā” ṭi saddam nicchāvetī. yañ ca padam yañ ca anupadam yañ ca anavakkharam yañ ca anubyañjanam sabbam etaṃ “padaso” {dhammo} (= v.l.) nāma; Sp 741.21f. ekamekam padam sāmaṇerena saddhim ekato ārabhivā ekato yeva niṭṭhāpetī.*

starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “Contact by the eye is impermanent,” (r3) (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

Likewise, (if a monk recites) “Contact by the ear,” “Contact by the nose,” “Contact by the tongue,” “Contact by the body,” “Contact by the mind is impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, (r4) recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “Contact by the mind is impermanent,” (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

(If a monk recites) “The feeling born of contact by the eye is impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, (r5) stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “The feeling born of contact by the eye is impermanent,” (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

Likewise, (if a monk recites) “The feeling born of contact by the ear is impermanent,” “The feeling born of contact by the nose is impermanent,” “The feeling born of contact by the tongue is (v1) impermanent,” “The feeling born of contact by the body is impermanent,” “The feeling born of contact by the mind is impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “The feeling born of contact by the mind is impermanent,” (v2) (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

(If a monk recites) “Visible objects are impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “Visible objects are impermanent,” (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk (v3) commits a *pācattika* offence.

(Likewise, if a monk recites) “Sounds are impermanent,” “Smells are impermanent,” “Flavours are impermanent,” “Contacts are impermanent,” “Mental phenomena are impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, (v4) recites after (the monk), “Mental phenomena are impermanent,” (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

(If a monk recites) “Perceptions of visible objects are impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, stops simultaneously, recites without pausing, repeats, recites after (the monk), “Perceptions of visible objects are impermanent,” (v5) (and the monk) continues (?) without stopping (him), the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.

(Likewise, if a monk recites) “Perceptions of sounds,” “Perceptions of smells,” “Perceptions of flavours,” “Perceptions of contacts,” “Perceptions of mental phenomena are impermanent,” (and one who is not ordained then) starts simultaneously, (stops) simultaneously, (recites without pausing, repeats, recites after [the monk]), “Perceptions of mental phenomena are impermanent”; ([and the monk] continues (?) without stopping [him], the monk commits a *pācattika* offence.)

*Translation of a Chinese parallel found in the Vinaya of the Mahāsāṃghikas*

Preliminary Remarks:

The following is an English translation of the section concerning the sixth *pācattika* found in the

Chinese translation of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas (MaVin 336c5–337a12).<sup>26</sup> In order to give the reader a clearer picture of the context, the whole section is translated here, while the part which corresponds to our Sanskrit folio is printed in bold.

Translation:

The Buddha was dwelling in the city of *Wilderness*.<sup>27</sup> Details are as given above.

At that time, a certain monk who was the supervisor (of the monastery)<sup>28</sup> taught many boys to recite the *Pārāyana*, phrase by phrase.

At that time, a thought occurred to a Brahman, “Where is the good and excellent Dharma to be found? I should renounce the household life there (where it is found).” Having thought thus, he immediately went to the *Wilderness* monastery with the desire to renounce the household life. He saw the monk teaching the boys to recite, and his tones in recitation sounded similar to those of boys who were learning recitation at any (Brahman’s) school. Then the Brahman thought, “Seeking for the excellent Dharma, I had originally wanted to renounce the household life under (them). But here they utter the sound *wei wei* which resembles the tones in recitation at any (Brahman’s) school. Also, it is impossible to distinguish the teacher from his pupils.”

Having seen this, he started to disbelieve. Then, without meeting the Buddha after all, he returned (home) immediately.

Monks went up to the World-Honoured One and told him about this matter.

The Buddha said, “Call the supervising monk here!” When he came, the Buddha asked the supervising monk, “Is it true?” He replied, “Yes, World-Honoured One!” The Buddha said, “This is a bad thing. Why did you make one who is not ordained recite the teachings phrase by phrase? From this day onward, I shall not allow (monks) to recite the teachings phrase by phrase for those who are not ordained.”

The Buddha (then) told the monks, “Make all the monks who are staying in the city of *Wilderness* gather!” (After they had assembled, the Buddha said):<sup>29</sup> “I am (now) setting down a rule for monks, for the sake of the ten sorts of benefits, and so on up to: One who has heard this once, should hear again:

<sup>30</sup>If a monk teaches one who is not ordained to recite the teachings phrase by phrase, that is a *pācattika*.

‘A monk’ means as stated above. ‘One who is not ordained’ means: those apart from monks and nuns. Though being ordained, nuns are not allowed to teach.

‘Phrase by phrase’ means: phrases (*pada*), expressions<sup>31</sup> or characters (*akṣara*), (i.e. the act of) reciting phrases, expressions or characters together.

‘Teachings’ means: spoken by the Buddha, or approved by the Buddha. ‘Spoken by the Buddha’ means: spoken by the Buddha himself. ‘Approved by the Buddha’ means: spoken by his disciples or other people and approved by the Buddha. From good dharmas up to Nirvāṇa, all of them are called the teachings.

<sup>26</sup> A French translation of this part is found in Lévi 1915: 422–424.

<sup>27</sup> Skt. *Ālavī*, Pā. *Ālavī*.

<sup>28</sup> 營事比丘: BHS *vaiyāpṛtya-kara*; *vaiyāvṛtya-k°*.

<sup>29</sup> Cf. Vin IV 14.28f.

<sup>30</sup> Cf. PrMoSū(Mā-L), p. 16, l. 16. *yo puna bhikṣur anupasampannam pudgalam padaśo dharmam vāceya, pācattikam* (Pācattika 6; “When one makes one who is not ordained speak Dharma line by line, that is a *pācattika*.”). See fn. (17).

<sup>31</sup> 味: lit. “tastes,” a translation of Skt. *vyañjana*. The word *vyañjana* means “sentence,” “expression,” “seasoning,” “sauce,” etc.

‘Teaches’ means: (he) instructs (by defining) words (in sūtras).

‘Pācattika’ means as stated above.

<sup>32</sup> If a monk makes one who is not ordained utter the sound ‘the eye is impermanent,’ (and the latter) raises, lowers, and silences his voice together (with the monk), (and the monk) enjoys this together without stopping him, that is a pācattika (for the monk concerned). Likewise ‘ear, nose, tongue, body, mind, the eighteen realms,<sup>33</sup> the five elements (skandhas), the six realms<sup>34</sup> and so on, until: ‘All things (dharmas) are painful, empty, impermanent, not-self.’

When a monk gives his co-resident pupil<sup>35</sup> or his dependent pupil (*antevāsika*) sūtras—e.g., the ‘Eight-Grouped Sūtra,’<sup>36</sup> the ‘Pārāyaṇa Sūtra,’ the ‘Sūtra of Dispute,’ the ‘Anavatapta Sūtra,’ the ‘Pratyayabuddha Sūtra’ etc.—and (his pupil) raises, lowers, and silences (his voice) at the same time as he does, he (i.e. the teacher) should instruct his pupil as follows, ‘You should wait until I stop, and then you can recite.’ If, being instructed thus, (a pupil) does not follow the instruction, he should not be taught. If the pupil says, ‘Please, Ācārya, transmit the sūtras to me again!’ then the teacher should reply, ‘If you don’t recite (sūtras) at the same time as (I do) again, I shall transmit them to you.’ Likewise, from disciples down to male and female lay followers, (under such conditions, sūtras) should not be transmitted to them.

When monks recite sūtras together, the elder monk should recite, and the younger one should follow him silently. When the elder monk stumbles, the younger one should recite, and the elder one should follow him silently. Similarly, (from disciples) down to female lay followers, they should do in like manner.

When (monks) recite verses in the Community, they are not allowed to recite the same verse together simultaneously. They are allowed to recite different verses simultaneously.” This has been thus stated (by the Buddha).

2) MS 2381/7, 2382/uf6/4f, 2382/uf6/2c, 2381/67, 2381/109, fol. 14(x)

### Transliteration

recto

1 ti prāptaṃ sākṣikṛtaṃ ti āha bhūte pācattikaṃ āsādayati so eṣo bhikṣuḥ ātm. [n]. s. [n]dh[ā]y. ātm[ā]ṇam upanidhā .. + + + + + + + + + + ha samvaragāmvinayā + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +

2 ti · āha deśanāgāmvinayātikkrāmam āsādayati · [ma]yā samādhi ca samādhiphalaṃ [c]e prāptaṃ sākṣikṛtaṃ ti .. + + + + + + + + + + .. vaṃ ime dharmā samāhite + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + +

3 imāṃ dharmāṃ upaniśrāya viharitavyaṃ ime dharmā prāptā sā ○ kṣikṛtā ti āha sam-

<sup>32</sup> MaVin. 336c26-29. 若比丘教未受具戒人言：“眼無常”聲，一時舉，一時下，一時斷聲，合爲樂，不遮，波夜提。耳、鼻、舌、身、意、十八界、五陰、六界—乃至諸法、苦、空、無常、非我，亦如是。

<sup>33</sup> 十八界: Skt. *aṣṭādaśa dhātavaḥ*, i.e. the six faculties, the six objects and the six cognitive functions.

<sup>34</sup> 六界: Skt. *ṣaḍ dhātavaḥ*, namely *pṛthivī-dhātu*, *ab-dh°*, *tejo-dh°*, *vāyu-dh°*, *ākāśa-dh°*.

<sup>35</sup> 共行弟子: cf. Pā. *saddhimvihārin*.

<sup>36</sup> 八群經: cf. BHS. *arthavargīyāni*. Presumably the discrepancy resulted from different interpretations of the word *aṭṭha*, which is a Middle Indic form of both Skt. *aṣṭa* (“eight”) and Skt. *artha* (“meaning”).





ā(tm)ānaṃ (saṃ)dhāya āt(m)ānaṃ (u)p(an)i(dhāya) ... v1 .o ca manasīkāro vidyā ca vimuktiṃ ceti  
 āha saṃvaragāṃvinayātikkrāmam āsādaya(it)|  
 (... deśanāgāṃvinayātikkrāmam āsādayati |)  
 (... prāptā sāksīkṛtā ti āha bhūte pācattikam āsā)2d(a)yati |

so eṣo bhikṣuḥ ātmānaṃ sandhāya ātmānaṃ upanidhāya evaṃ trayo vi(dyā tra)y(o) vihārā tray(o)  
 samādh(ayaḥ) (ti āha saṃvara)gāṃvinayātikkrāmam āsādayati |  
 ... (deśanāgāṃvini)3nayātikkrāmam āsādayati |  
 mayā trayāḥ samādhayaḥ prāptā sāksīkṛtā ti (āha) bhūte pācattikam āsādaya(ti) |

(so eṣo bhikṣuḥ) ātmānaṃ sandhāya ātmānaṃ upa(nidhāya ... ti āha, saṃvaragā)4miviniyāti-  
 kkrāmam āsādayati |  
 mama<sup>38</sup> catvāri smṛtyupasthānānīti āha deśanāgāṃvinayātikkrāmam āsā(dayati |)  
 ... ā prāptā sāksīkṛtā ti ā(ha) bhūte pācattikam āsādayati |)

(so eṣo bhikṣuḥ āt)5tmānaṃ sandhāya ātmānaṃ upanidhāya evaṃ catvāri samyak(p)rahāṇā catvāri  
 rddhipādā catvāri samādhayo catvā(ri) ... (prati)padā catvāri pratisaṃvidā ...

### Translation

Recto:

(If a monk ...) (r1) says, "I have attained and realised ... ," and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.<sup>39</sup>

If a certain monk,<sup>40</sup> in regard to himself, concerning himself,<sup>41</sup> says, "...," (he commits a transgression) of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by self-restraint.<sup>42</sup>

If (he) says, "...," (r2) he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by confession.<sup>43</sup>

<sup>38</sup> Ms mayā.

<sup>39</sup> *prāptam sāksīkṛtam* "ti āha, bhūte pācattikam āsādayati : Cf. PrMoSū(Mā-L), p. 16, l. 17f. *yo puna bhikṣur anupasampannasya pudgalasya santike ātmōpanāyikam uttarimanuṣyadharmam alamāryajñānadarśanaṃ viśeṣādhi-gamaṃ pratijāneya iti jānāmi iti paśyāmīti bhūtasmiṃ, pācattikam* (Pācattika 7; "Whatever monk should, in the presence of an unordained person, boast with regard to himself, of having superhuman faculties, sufficient noble insight and knowledge, and a specific spiritual realization, saying: 'Thus do I know, thus do I see'; if it is a fact, that is a pācattika." [Prebish 1975: 74]); cf. also Vin IV 25.f. *yo pana bhikkhu anupasampannassa uttarimanussadhammam āroceyya bhūtasmiṃ, pācittiyam* (Pācittiya 8).

<sup>40</sup> *so eṣo bhikṣuḥ*: this phrase does not mean "this monk" but "if a certain monk." Cf. Abhis. 19B7 *so eṣo bhikṣuḥ niravaśeṣam dantakāṣṭham khādati vinayātikkrāmam āsādayati* ("If a monk chews a piece of wood used for brushing teeth, leaving no residue, he commits a (minor) transgression of the *Vinaya* rules."); BhiVin(Mā-L) § 234, 8A8.5. *so eṣo ūna-sapta-varṣo cellako bhavati ...* ("If there is a boy of less than seven years of age, ..."); *do. §115 sā eṣū bhikṣuṇī rakta-cittā puruṣam darśanāya utthāpeti ...* ("Si une nonne, l'esprit passionné, cherche à voir un homme. ... " [Nolot 1991: 62]).

<sup>41</sup> *ātmānaṃ sandhāya ātmānaṃ upanidhyāya*: cf. BhiVin(Mā-L) §252, 9A4.3 "*ātmārthāyē*" *ti ātmānaṃ sandhāya ātmānaṃ upanidhyāya* (" 'Pour elle-même' signifie 'la concernant elle-même, en pensant à elle-même' " [Nolot 1991: 326]).

<sup>42</sup> *saṃvaragāmi-vinayātikkrāmam āsādayati*: See the next footnote.

<sup>43</sup> *deśanāgāṃvinayātikkrāmam āsādayati*: *Samvara-gāṃvinayātikkrāma* and *deśanā-g°* are technical terms characteristic of the Mahāśāṃghika-Lokottaravādins. Although they both designate rather light offences, the latter is more

If (he says), "I have attained and realised concentrations and the fruit of (these) concentrations," (and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.)

<sup>44</sup>Likewise, these dharmas which one who is concentrated in his mind, ... (?)

(If a certain monk, in regard to himself, concerning himself,) (r3) says, "... One ought to rely on these dharmas.<sup>45</sup> These dharmas have been attained and realised," he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by self-restraint.

(If he) says, "... have been attained and realised," (he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed) by confession.

(If he ...) says, "(I have attained) (r4) and realised ...," and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.

If a certain monk, (in regard to) himself, concerning himself, says, "...," he (commits a transgression) of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by self-restraint.

(If he ...,) (r5) he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by confession.

If (he says), "I have attained (and realised) tranquillity and insight," (and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.)

If (a monk),<sup>46</sup> in regard to himself, concerning himself, says, "...," (v1) mental concentration, knowledge, and release," he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by self-restraint.

(If he says, "...," he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by confession.

If he says, "I have attained and realised ...," (and it is true,) (v2) he commits (a *pācattika* offence.)

If a certain monk, in regard to himself, concerning himself, (says:) "The three kinds of knowledge,<sup>47</sup> the three states,<sup>48</sup> the three kinds of concentrations<sup>49</sup> are thus," he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed (by self-restraint.)

(If he says, "...,") (v3) he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by confession).

---

serious. Cf. *BhīVin*(Mā-L) §115 *sā eṣā bhikṣuṇī rakta-cittā puruṣaṃ darśanāya uṭṭhāpeti samvara-gāmi-vinayātilāman āsādayati; darśana-śravaṇe deśanā-gāmi-vinayātikramam āsādayati* ("Si une nonne, l'esprit passionné, cherche à voir un homme, elle commet une infraction à la discipline donnant lieu à restreinte; si elle s'entretient avec lui, elle commet une infraction à la discipline donnant lieu à confession" [Nolot 1991: 62]) The same expression occurs repeatedly in *BhīVin*(Mā-L) §124, 3B2.6f.; cf. Hirakawa, *BhīVin*. 105, fn. 9, 10; Nolot 1991: 384.

<sup>44</sup> Or "(If a monk) says, 'These dharmas which one who is concentrated in his mind ... are such (?) ... One ought to rely on these dharmas ...'" The context here is rather unclear.

<sup>45</sup> *imāṃ dharmāṃ upanīśāya viharitavyaṃ*: cf. SN I 89.1~2 *eko dhammo upanissāya vihātabbo—appamādo kusalesu dhammesu*; AN IV 354.4 *cattāro dhammā upanissāya vihātabbā*.

<sup>46</sup> There is no room for these words in the fragment.

<sup>47</sup> *trayo vidyā* : Cf. DN III 220.15f. *tisso vijjā: pubbenivāsānussatiñāṇaṃ vijjā, sattānaṃ cutūpapāte ñāṇaṃ vijjā, āsavānaṃ khaye ñāṇaṃ vijjā*. Cf. also Saṅg pp. 91–92.

<sup>48</sup> *trayo viharā*: cf. DN III 220.18f. *tayo viharā: dibbo vihāro, brahma-vihāro, ariyo vihāro*. Cf. also Saṅg p. 88.

<sup>49</sup> *trayo samādhayaḥ*: cf. DN III 219.19f. *tayo samādhi: savitakko savicāro samādhi, avitakko vicāramatto samādhi, avitakko avicāro sāmādhi. apare 'pi tayo samādhi: suññato sāmādhi, animitto samādhi, appaṇihito samādhi*. Cf. also Saṅg p. 88.

If he (says), “I have attained and realised the three kinds of concentrations,” and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.

(If a certain monk), in regard to himself, concerning himself, (says, “...”), (v4) he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by self-restraint).

If he says, “The four applications of mindfulness of mine,”<sup>50</sup> he commits a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules which can be redressed by confession.

If he says, “I have attained and realised ...,” (and it is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence.)

(If a certain monk), (v5) in regard to himself, concerning himself, (says:) “The four right exertions,<sup>51</sup> the four bases of transcendental knowledge,<sup>52</sup> the four concentrations,<sup>53</sup> the four ..., (the four) practices,<sup>54</sup> the four kinds of logical analysis<sup>55</sup> ... are thus,” ...

*Translation of a Chinese parallel  
found in the Vinaya of the Mahāsāṃghikas*

**Preliminary Remarks:**

The following is an English translation of the section concerning the seventh *pācattika* found in the Chinese translation of the *Prātimokṣa-Vibhaṅga* of the Mahāsāṃghikas (MaVin. 337a13–b14). As this offence is almost identical with the fourth *pārājika*,<sup>56</sup> details were omitted in the commentary on the former, with a reference to the one on the latter. Thus the portion which corresponds to our Sanskrit folio is found also in the commentary part of the *pārājika* offence, whereas it is left out in that of the *pācattika* one. Therefore, the parallel sentences found in the *pārājika* offence (MaVin. 261a7–19) are also translated into English here.

**Translation of MaVin 337a13–b14:**

The Buddha was dwelling in the city of Śrāvastī. Details are as given above. (The introductory story) is (almost) the same as the detailed story<sup>57</sup> which describes the cause and occasion of (setting) the rule against false speech, which is the fourth (of the *pārājika* rules). However, there is a slight difference (between the two stories), namely here (the monk) spoke the truth (that he had acquired superhuman dharmas, while in the introductory story to the fourth *pārājika* rule, the monk told a lie); and so on, until: The Buddha said to the monk, “This is a bad thing. Your deed is

<sup>50</sup> *mama* (ms *mayā*): cf. MaVin 337a22. 若言：“我法智”，越毘尼罪 (“If one says, ‘My knowledge of the Dharma,’ that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules”).

<sup>51</sup> *catvāri samyakprahāṇā*: cf. DN III 221.11f. *cattāro sammapadhānā* ...; cf. also Saṅg p. 94. *catvāri samyakprahāṇāni*...

<sup>52</sup> *catvāri iddhipādā*: cf. DN III 221.23f. *cattāro iddhipādā*. ... *chanda-samādhi-padhāna-saṃkhāra-samannāgataṃ iddhipādaṃ bhāveti, citta-samādhi° i° bh°, viriya-samādhi° i° bh°, vimamsā-samādhi° i° bh°*. Cf. also Saṅg p. 94.

<sup>53</sup> *catvāri samādhayo*: cf. DN III 277.1f. *cattāro samādhi*: *hānabhāgiyo samādhi, ippitibhāgiyo s°, visesabhāgiyo s°, nibbedhabhāgiyo s°, SN V 268.8f. chanda-samādhi ... viriya-s° ... citta-s° ... vimamsā-s°*.

<sup>54</sup> (*catvāri prati*)*padā*: cf. DN III 228.23f. *catasso paṭipadā*: *dukkhā paṭipadā dandhābhīṇṇā, dukkhā paṭipadā khippābhīṇṇā, sukhā paṭipadā dandhābhīṇṇā, sukhā paṭipadā khippābhīṇṇā*. Cf. also Saṅg p. 112.

<sup>55</sup> *catvāri pratisaṃvidā*: cf. Mvu 321. 14f. *artha-pratisaṃvidā*[sic]-*prāptā dharma-pr° nirukti-pra° pratibhāna-pr°*; AN II 160.22f. *attha-paṭisambhidā ... dhamma-p° ... nirutti-p° ... paṭibhāna-p°*.

<sup>56</sup> If what the monk boasts about is not true, he commits a *pārājika*, the gravest type of offence, and is expelled from the Community; while, if what he boasts about is true, he commits a *pācattika* offence. That is the only difference between the two rules.

<sup>57</sup> MaVin 259c6ff.

like that of a prostitute who lives by selling herself. You preach to people about the subtle, true Dharma just for material gain, namely you are selling yourselves for your living.”

The Buddha (then) told the monks, “Make all monks who are staying in the city of Śrāvastī gather!” (After they had assembled, the Buddha said), “I am (now) setting down a rule for monks, for the sake of the ten sorts of benefits, and so on, until: One who has heard this once, should hear again:

<sup>58</sup> If a monk boasts of having acquired superhuman dharmas, (saying:) ‘Thus I do know, thus I do see,’ and what he says is true, that is a *pācattika*. The meaning of ‘A monk’ is as stated above. The meaning of ‘boasts of having acquired superhuman dharmas’ and that of ‘superhuman dharmas’ are as stated above. If one says, ‘Is it my knowledge of the Dharma?’<sup>59</sup> that is a transgression of the Vinaya rules (which can be redressed by) repentance.<sup>60</sup> If one says, ‘My knowledge of the Dharma,’<sup>61</sup> that is a transgression of the Vinaya rules.<sup>62</sup> If one says, ‘I have attained and realised the knowledge of the Dharma,’ that is a *pācattika*. ... These items are as stated above in detail, and so on, until: (If one says, ‘I have attained and realised’) the ten dharmas of those who need no more learning,’ and it is true, then that is a *pācattika*.<sup>63</sup>

If a monk tells a woman, ‘All of the monks who are staying at such-and-such a place for the rains retreat are not ordinary ones,’ that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by) repentance.

If he, being asked, ‘Is your Reverence also amongst those (not ordinary monks)?’, replies, ‘I am also amongst them,’ that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules.

If one, being asked by a female lay follower, ‘Does your Reverence also possess these dharmas?’, replies, ‘Yes, I possess them,’ and it is true, then that is a *pācattika*.

If a monk tells a female lay follower, ‘All of the monks who are performing the *Pravāraṇā* ceremony at such-and-such a place are not ordinary ones. They are all *arhats*,’ that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by) repentance.

If he, being asked by the female lay follower (337b), ‘Is your Reverence also performing the *Pravāraṇā* ceremony there?’, replies, ‘Yes,’ that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules.

Moreover, if he, being asked by her, ‘Has your Reverence also attained arhatship?’, replies, ‘Yes, I have,’ and it is true, then that is a *pācattika*.

Likewise, if one says, ‘Monks who sit on (seats made of) woven rope at such-and-such a place,<sup>64</sup> (monks) who (stay) at the royal house, at a minister’s house, at a rich man’s house, at a householder’s house, at your house; (monks) who instruct your relatives on sūtras; and so on,

<sup>58</sup> MaVin 337a19–24 若比丘自稱：“得過人法，我如是知，如是見”，說實者，波夜提。“比丘”者，如上說。“自稱過人法”，“過人法”，如上說。若自言：“我法智耶”，越毘尼心悔。若言：“我法智”，越毘尼罪。若言：“我得法智作證”，波夜提。句句如上廣說。乃至十無學法。說實者，波夜提。

<sup>59</sup> 我法智耶：The meaning of this sentence is unclear.

<sup>60</sup> 越毘尼心悔：This seems to correspond to *samvaragāmi-vinayāṅkramam āsādayati* (see fn. 43) in our fragment; cf. Hirakawa, BhīVin. 105, fn. 9.

<sup>61</sup> 我法智：The meaning of this sentence is unclear.

<sup>62</sup> 越毘尼罪：This seems to correspond to *deśanāgāmi-vinayāṅkramam āsādayati* (see fn. 43) in our fragment; cf. Hirakawa, BhīVin 105, fn. 10.

<sup>63</sup> If it is not a fact, then that is a *pārājika* offence.

<sup>64</sup> Read 某處繩<牀>里 instead of 某處繩里? Cf. MaVin 261c3 某處坐上比丘皆非凡夫。皆是阿羅漢皆得勝妙法 “Monks who sit in the upper place are all not ordinary monks. All of them are *arhats*. All of them have attained superior and subtle dharmas.”

until:<sup>65</sup> monks who go away in such and such a manner; (monks) who stand, sit, lie (in such and such a manner); (monks) who wear such and such robes; (monks) who carry such and such bowls; (monks) who take such and such meals (are not ordinary ones. They are all *arhats*),’ (each of those utterances is an offence).

When one using the language of the Middle Country makes (the above stated) utterance towards those who are from the countryside; or, when one using a country dialect makes (the above stated) utterance towards those who are from the Middle Country; or when one using the language of the Middle Country makes (the above stated) utterance towards those who are from the Middle Country; or when one using a country dialect makes (the above stated) utterance towards those who are from the countryside, and if one recites (only) the meaning but not the expression (lit. tastes),<sup>66</sup> that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules. If one recites (only) the expression but not the meaning,<sup>67</sup> that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by) repentance. If one recites both the meaning and the expression,<sup>68</sup> then that is a *pācattika*. If one recites neither the meaning nor the expression, then there is no offence.

(However,) if one indicates the meaning by writing or by gesturing, but does not indicate the expression, that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules. If one indicates the expression but not the meaning, that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by) repentance. If one indicates both the meaning and the expression, then it is a *thūlaccaya*. If one neither indicates the meaning nor the expression, then there is no offence. And so on, until: If one shows himself to be an *arhat*, that is a transgression of the *Vinaya* rules (which can be redressed by) repentance.” This has been thus stated (by the Buddha).

MaVin 261a7–19:

“Superhuman dharmas” means: the ten knowledges, namely knowledge of the Dharma, knowledge about what is unknown, common knowledge, knowledge of others’ thoughts, knowledges regarding suffering, arising (of suffering), extinction (of suffering), and the path (leading to its extinction), knowledge of the passing away (of beings) (*lśaya-jñāna*), and knowledge of non-origination (*anutpāda-jñāna*); emancipation through annihilation (?); superior and virtuous mind; bringing roots of merit to full maturity; emancipation from both purity and impurity; clear knowledge of the Dharma;<sup>69</sup> the fruit of (the attainment of the stage of) *srotaāpanna* and meditative concentrations of this stage; entering, coming out of and staying (in a meditative concentration?) well; (and) receiving correctly and realising (the following practices), namely tranquillity (*śamatha*) and contemplation (*vipāśyanā*), the three kinds of meditative concentration (*samādhi*), the three kinds of knowledge (*vidyā*); the four applications of mindfulness (*smṛtyupasthāna*), the four correct endeavours (*samyakprahāṇa*), the four bases of transcendental knowledge (*ṛddhipāda*), the four kinds of meditation, the four unfathomable minds, the four kinds of formless concentration, the four sacred paths, the four noble lineages, the four noble truths, the four fruits of śramaṇahood; the five kinds of meditative concentration, the five faculties, the five powers, the five occasions for emancipation; the six unsurpassed dharmas,

<sup>65</sup> See MaVin 261c5f.

<sup>66</sup> According to MaVin 261c20, this means that the monk praises himself, but not *arhats*.

<sup>67</sup> According to MaVin 261c21, this means that the monk praises *arhats*, but not himself.

<sup>68</sup> According to MaVin 261c22, this means that the monk praises himself, by saying he is an *arhat*.

<sup>69</sup> MaVin 261a10–12 須陀洹果及所滿三昧，善入出住，正受作證：所謂止、觀、三三昧、三明、四念處、四正勤、四如意足。

the six noble dharmas, the six elements leading to deliverance, the six forms of mindfulness, the six supernatural powers; the sevenfold wealth, the seven dharmas of arhatship, the seven meditative concentrations, the seven powers leading to the destruction of defilements (*āsravaḥṣayajñānabala*), the seven factors of enlightenment, the eightfold right path, the eight spheres of sovereignty (*abhibhvāyatana*), the eight kinds of emancipation, the eight practices leading (to emancipation?); the nine perceptions, the ninefold joy of the Dharma (?), the ninefold fulfilment of the practices of purity (?), the nine successive concentrations; the ten states of living as a noble one (*āryavāsa*), the ten entrances into entire (concentration) (*kr̥tsnāyatana*), the ten ways of separating from flames (*nirjvaravastu*, Pā. *nijjaravatthu*), the ten dharmas of those who no longer need to learn, the ten kinds of power leading to the destruction of defilements (*āsravaḥṣayajñānabala*)—these are the “superhuman dharmas.”

## Symbols

Symbols, used in the transliteration, are listed above.

Other Symbols:

Pā = Pāli

Skt = Sanskrit

° = except for letters, following or preceding the sign, the word is the same as the preceding one.

- = stem of a word, e.g. *dharmā-*.

## Literature

Abhis = *The Facsimile Edition of the Abbisamācārika-Dharma of the Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin* 大眾部說出世部律·比丘威儀法梵文寫本影印版, Beijing 1996 (Press of Nationalities 民族出版社) (Series of Sanskrit Palm-leaf Manuscripts formerly kept in the China Ethnic Library 中國民族圖書館原藏梵文貝葉寫本叢書).

AN = *Anguttara-Nikāya*, ed. R.Morris, E.Hardy, 5 vols., London 1885-1900 (PTS).

BhīVin(Mā-L) = *Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya, including Bhikṣuṇī-Prakīrṇaka and a summary of the Bhikṣu-Prakīrṇaka of the Ārya-Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin*, ed. Gustav Roth, Patna 1970 (*Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 12*).

BHS(D, G) = Franklin Edgerton, *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary*, 2 vols, New Haven 1953.

CPD = *A Critical Pāli Dictionary*, begun by V. Trenckner, ed. D. Andersen et al., Copenhagen, 1924~.

DhVin = The Vinaya of the Dharmaguptakas, T. no.1428 四分律, trans. Buddhayaśas and 竺佛念 Zhú Fóniàn, A.D. 412.

DN = *The Dīgha Nikāya*, ed. T.W. Rhys Davids and J. E. Carpenter, 3 vols., London 1890-1911 (PTS).

von Hinüber, Oskar

1968 *Studien zur Kasussyntax des Pāli, besonders des Vinaya-piṭaka*, München (*Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft Beihefte, Neue Folge 2*).

1985 "Die Bestimmung der Schulzugehörigkeit buddhistischer Texte nach sprachlichen Kriterien" in: *Zur Schulzugehörigkeit von Werken der Hīnayāna-Literatur*, Erster Teil, herausgegeben von H. Bechert, Göttingen, S.57-75.

2001 *Das ältere Mittelindisch im Überblick, 2., erweiterte Auflage*, Wien: Verlag der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften (SbÖAW Bd. 467 = Veröffentlichung der Kommission für Sprachen und Kulturen Südasien, Heft 20).

Hirakawa, BhīVin = *Monastic Discipline for the Buddhist Nuns. An English Translation of the Chinese Text of the Mahāsāṃghika-Bhikṣuṇī-Vinaya*, Patna: K. P. Jayaswal Research Institute, 1982 (*Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 21*).

Lévi, Sylvain

1915 "La récitation primitive des textes bouddhiques," in: *Journal Asiatique* (Mai-Juin 1915), pp. 401-447.

MaVin = The Vinaya of the Mahāsāṃghikas, T. no.1425 摩訶僧祇律, trans. Buddhahadra and 法顯 Fǎxiǎn (or Fa-Hsien), A.D.418.

MśVin = The Vinaya of the Mahīśāsakas, T. no.1421 彌沙塞部和醯五分律, trans. Buddhajīva, Zhú Dàoshēng 竺道生 et. al., A.D.424.

MūVinVibh(Ch.) = The Chinese translation of the Vinayavibhaṅga of the Bhikṣuprātimokṣa of the so-called Mūlasarvāstivādins, T. no. 1442 根本說一切有部毘奈耶, trans. 義淨 Yìjìng, around A.D. 710.

MūVinVibh(Tib.) = The Tibetan translation of the Vinayavibhaṅga of the Bhikṣuprātimokṣa of the so-called Mūlasarvāstivādins, '*Dul ba rnam par 'byed pa*, trans. Jinamitra and Klu'i rgyal mtshan.

Mvu = *Le Mahāvastu*, texte sanscrit publié pour la première fois et accompagné d'introductions et d'un commentaire, par É. Senart, Paris 1882-1897, 3 vols. (Imprimerie nationale); Reprint: Tokyo 1977 (Meicho-Fukyū-Kai).

MW = Monier Monier-Williams, *A Sanskrit-English Dictionary*, Oxford 1970(1899)



Nishimura, Minori 西村実則

- 1990 「言語」に対するブツダの態度——地方語・チャンダス・歌詠声—— (Buddha's attitude towards the language —dialects, *chandas*, *bhāṣā*), in: 三康文化研究所年報 (*Annual of the Sanko Research Institute for the Studies of Buddhism*), No. 22, pp. 155~225.

Nolot, Édith

- 1991 *Règles de discipline des nonnes bouddhistes: Le Bhikṣuṇīvinaya de l'école Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin*, traduction annotée, commentaire, collation du manuscrit, Paris: de Boccard (Publications de l'Institut de civilisation indienne 8/60)

Prebish, Charles S.

- 1975 *Buddhist Monastic Discipline: The Sanskrit Prātimokṣa Sūtras of the Mahāsāṃghikas and Mūlasarvāstivādins*, University Park and London: Pennsylvania State University Press.

PrMoSū(Mā-L) = *Prātimokṣasūtram of the Lokottaravādinmahāsāṃghika School*, ed. Nathmal Tatia, Patna 1976 (*Tibetan Sanskrit Works Series 16*)

PTS = The Pali Text Society

Roth, Gustav

- 1968 "Terminologisches aus dem Vinaya der Mahāsāṃghika-Lokottaravādin", in: *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* 118: 334-348 = 1980: 75-89.

- 1986 *Indian Studies*, Selected Papers, ed. H. Bechert and P. Kieffer-Pülz, Delhi 1986 (*Bibliotheca Indo-Buddhica* 32).

Saṅg = Valentina Stache-Rosen, *Dogmatische Begriffsbildung im älteren Buddhismus, II: Das Saṅgītisūtra und sein Kommentar Saṅgītiparyāya*, Teil 1-2, Berlin (*Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden* 9)

SaVin = The Vinaya of the Sarvāstivādins, T. no. 1435 十誦律, trans. Kumārajīva, Puṇyatrāta and Dharmaruci, A.D.404.

Sp = *Samantapāsādikā, Buddhaghosa's Commentary on the Vinaya Piṭaka*, ed. J. Takakusu and M. Nagai, 7 vols., London 1924-1947 (PTS), <sup>2</sup>1966-1982 (PTS).

T = Taishō Shinshū Daizōkyō, 大正新脩大藏經, ed. J. Takakusu and K. Watanabe, 100 vols., Tokyo 1924-34.

TibT = *The Tibetan Tripitaka: Taipei Edition*, ed. A. W. Barber, Taipei 1991, 72 vols. (SMC Publishing).

Vin = *Vinayapiṭaka*, ed. H. Oldenberg, 5 vols., London 1879-1883 (PTS).

VinVibh(R) = Valentina Rosen, *Der Vinayavibhāṅga zum Bhikṣuprātimokṣa der Sarvāstivādins, Sanskritfragmente nebst einer Analyse der chinesischen Übersetzung*, Berlin 1959 (*Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden* 2).